Routledge Innovations in Political Theory

DEMOCRATIC POLITICAL TRAGEDY IN THE POSTCOLONY

**THE TRAGEDY OF POSTCOLONIALITY IN
MICHAEL MANLEY'S JAMAICA AND NELSON MANDELA'S
SOUTH AFRICA**

Greg A. Graham

In this tightly argued and fascinating study, Greg Graham seeks to explore and comprehend a certain narrative of disappointing outcomes and dreams deferred that has been the overwhelming pattern among newly independent countries of the South, or what Achille Mbembe appropriately terms the postcolony. Abandoning linear notions of progress which run counter to lived experiences, Graham instead draws significantly on left Hegelian dialectics, David Scott's reflections and Frantz Fanon's notion of national consciousness to center tragedy as a critical conceptual tool with which to grasp these histories. His interlocutors are Michael Manley of the period of Democratic Socialism in Jamaica (1972–1980) and Nelson Mandela and his leadership in post-Apartheid South Africa. Both Manley and Mandela are situated as charismatic leaders who played central roles in processes of popular uplift and national regeneration, but who ultimately failed to fulfill their promises. The concurrent triumph of neo-liberalism is seen as both the failure of these leaders to sustain policies built on democratic foundations of marronage and national consciousness, as well as the effect of powerful international forces arrayed against them. Greg Graham, however, doesn't end his conversation at the moment of tragedy, but suggests that despite the overwhelming weight of the neo-liberal ascendancy, the experience of tragedy and its effects is, in dialectical fashion, a teaching moment, leading to fresh attempts at thinking through new projects based on freedom and democracy and scaling the parapets of seemingly unassailable power.

Brian Meeks, *Professor of Africana Studies, Brown University*

Greg Graham's *Democratic Political Tragedy in the Postcolony* is a brilliant and heartfelt attempt at theorizing, in terms of tragedy, the collapse of the epic aspirations of the mid-20th century anti-colonial movements as most were rolled over by the counter-revolutionary neoliberal strategies of global capitalism. It is a work that effectively poeticizes these historic struggles and historicizes their poetic foundations. A must read for postcolonial scholars and, particularly, those of Jamaica and South Africa.

Paget Henry, *Professor of Sociology and Africana Studies, Brown University*

A virtue of this remarkable book is that it actually offers a *theory*, grounded in rich historical evidence, through which to understand the now clichéd conclusion seemingly inevitable failure of former colonies of the global south. Provocatively creolizing the political thought of Hegel on tragedy through an examination of recent Africana political philosophical reflections on the same, Greg Graham materializes these ideas in this detailed study of two recent giants of resistance from the Caribbean and Southern Africa—Michael Manley and Nelson Mandela—who were ultimately constrained by neoliberal impositions, investments, and military force. The result is a powerfully written profound treatise not only of traditional political scientific concerns of leadership, power, and effective administering but also of relationships between the ethical and the political, the meaning of political action, the shifting symbolic meaning of history, and notions of possibility and potential in social-political phenomena—in short, *necessary thought* as humanity unfortunately continues to struggle through proverbially interesting times.

Lewis Gordon, *Honorary President of the Global Center for Advanced Study and author of What Fanon Said: A Philosophical Study of His Life and Thought*

Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Democratic Political Tragedy in the Postcolony

A ground-breaking work in Africana political thought that links the plight of progressive political endeavors in Africa with those in the Diaspora and beyond, *Democratic Tragedy in the Postcolony* engages with two of the defining political sagas of the postcolonial era. The book presents Michael Manley of Jamaica and Nelson Mandela of South Africa as tragic political leaders at the helm of popular democratic projects that run aground in the face of the constraints that a subordinate position in the global economy presents for such endeavors. Jamaica's experiment with democratic socialism as an alternative path to development at the height of the Cold War is considered alongside post-apartheid South Africa's search for a development model consistent with the demand for civic empowerment and equitable distribution of social goods in the aftermath of Apartheid.

Democratic Political Tragedy in the Postcolony theorizes the defining tragic impasse and the telling vacillations by which the postcolonies in question are brought to the neoliberal catastrophes that currently prevail.

Greg A. Graham is Assistant Professor of African & African American Studies at the University of Oklahoma. His areas of specialization include Africana Political Thought, African Politics, Caribbean Politics, Diasporic Studies, Critical Race Theory, Classical Political Theory, and Modern Political Theory.

Routledge Innovations in Political Theory

For more information about this series, please visit: www.routledge.com/Routledge-Innovations-in-Political-Theory/book-series/IPT

68 Post-Politics in Context
<i>Ali Rıza Taşkale</i>	75 Reclaiming Representation
Contemporary Advances in the
Theory of Political Representation
<i>Edited by Mónica Brito Vieira</i>
69 Claus Offe and the Critical
Theory of the Capitalist State
<i>Jens Borchert and
Stephan Lessenich</i>	76 Dignity and Human Rights
Language Philosophy and Social
Realizations
<i>Stephan P. Leher</i>
70 Equality Renewed
<i>Christine Sypnowich</i>	77 A Conceptual Investigation of
Justice
<i>Kyle Johannsen</i>
71 Rethinking Utopia
Place, Power, Affect
<i>David M. Bell</i>	78 Compromise and Disagreement
in Contemporary Political Theory
<i>Edited by Christian F. Rostbøll
and Theresa Scavenius</i>
72 Hugo Grotius and the Modern
Theology of Freedom
<i>Jeremy Seth Geddert</i>	79 Democratic Political Tragedy in
the Postcolony
The Tragedy of Postcoloniality in
Michael Manley's Jamaica and
Nelson Mandela's South Africa
<i>Greg A. Graham</i>
73 Critical Urban Theory,
Common Property, and
"the Political"
Desire and Drive in the City
<i>Dan Webb</i>	80 Epistemontology in Spinoza–
Marx–Freud–Lacan
The (Bio)Power of Structure
<i>A. Kiarina Kordela</i>
74 Democracy Beyond the
Nation State
Practicing Equality
<i>Joe Parker</i>	

Democratic Political Tragedy in the Postcolony

The Tragedy of Postcoloniality in
Michael Manley's Jamaica and
Nelson Mandela's South Africa

Greg A. Graham

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group
NEW YORK AND LONDON

First published 2018
by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

and by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2018 Taylor & Francis

The right of Greg A. Graham to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Names: Graham, Greg A., author.

Title: Democratic political tragedy in the postcolony : the tragedy of postcoloniality in Michael Manley's Jamaica and Nelson Mandela's South Africa / Greg A. Graham.

Description: New York, NY : Routledge, 2017. | Series: Routledge innovations in political theory ; 79 | Originally presented as the author's thesis (doctoral)—Temple University, 2012, under the title: Postcolonial tragedy : Jamaica and South Africa in comparative perspective. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017030532 (print) | LCCN 2017035335 (ebook) | ISBN 9781315444529 (Master) | ISBN 9781315444512 (WebPDF) | ISBN 9781315444505 (ePub) | ISBN 9781315444499 (Mobipocket/Kindle) | ISBN 9781138215115 | ISBN 9781138215115q(hardback ;qalk. paper) | ISBN 1138215112q(hardback ;qalk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Jamaica—Politics and government—1962- | South Africa—Politics and government—1994- | Democracy—Jamaica—History—20th century. | Democracy—South Africa—History—20th century. | Manley, Michael, 1924-1997—Political and social views. | Mandela, Nelson, 1918-2013—Political and social views. | Postcolonialism—Jamaica. | Postcolonialism—South Africa.

Classification: LCC JL639.A15 (ebook) | LCC JL639.A15 G73 2017 (print) | DDC 320.9206—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017030532>

ISBN: 978-1-138-21511-5 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-44452-9 (ebk)

Typeset in Times New Roman
by Wearset Ltd, Boldon, Tyne and Wear

**For George R. Graham and Ena McKoy, who first had to bear
my constant questioning “why?”**

Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
1 Introduction: Democratic Political Tragedy	1
2 Thinking with Hegel: Experience, Conflict, and Reversal	17
3 Creolizing Hegel's Theory of Tragedy	37
4 Manley's Jamaica: The Tragedy of Democratic Socialism	57
5 Mandela and the Tragedy of the Post-Apartheid State	97
6 The Aftermath of Tragedy: Patterson, Mbeki, and the Neoliberal Age (Postscript)	130
Conclusion	140
<i>Index</i>	143

Acknowledgments

So many names come to mind when I reflect upon the support I have received from friends and colleagues alike toward the completion of this project. I must express my gratitude first of all to Joseph M. Schwartz, Lewis R. Gordon, Jane A. Gordon, and Heath Fogg-Davis, the members of my dissertation committee at Temple University who all helped to make bearable the challenge of moving from the formative stages of conceptualizing the project to its earliest form as my dissertation. As members of that committee and two of my chief guides through my experience with the American academy Lewis and Jane have offered council, critique and encouragement at important stages of this venture. Likewise did Joseph Schwartz who was head of the committee and on whose experience in the writing and production process I relied just as heavily.

I must express my appreciation as well for the intellectual companionship of members of my cohort from Temple University. Of the long list of names and faces, those of Devon Johnson, Vincent Beaver, Kevin Hockmuth, and John Hykel stand out. It was with these fine gentlemen that I first began to think and work through the question of the meaning of the tragic political experience. Gentlemen, it would appear that the evenings spent on the roof of Anderson Hall and on the benches around Gladfelter Hall, as we juggled the grunt work of being TA's and adjuncts with the pressing intellectual responsibilities of being graduate students, have proven fruitful.

I have to give special mention as well to Michael J. Monahan of Marquette University for the pathway to a more refined understanding of Hegel that he helped me upon, and for taking time out to read chapters from the manuscript. Nigel Gibson of Emerson College and Brian Meeks of Brown University likewise deserve special mention in this regard as well. My thanks by extension go out to the broader family of the Caribbean Philosophical Association (CPA). Their ongoing mission to shift the geography of reason has been a source of inspiration for my own thinking and writing. The efforts of the people that gather for their annual conference provided the spark that ignited my own intellectual endeavors. I had the honor of introducing the theory I outline in these pages at their annual gathering in 2014. It has come a long way since then. I trust it meets with the levels of innovation and academic rigor that is typical of the work that is characteristic of intellectual enterprises that come from this unique community of scholars.

My colleagues at the University of Oklahoma Catherine John, Bala Sahao, Ben Kepel, Lupe Davidson, Peter Barker, Kelvin White, Karlos Hill, and Jeanette Davidson all helped to provide both the intellectual and in some instances the moral support I needed in what has proven over the past year to be very trying times. Likewise did my very close friends Illyich Campbell, Nadja Briscoe, Peta-Gaye Hermitt, Elinor Stimpson, Stanford Watson, and Maziki Thame who were invaluable to keeping me grounded and focussed when the vicissitudes of adult life swayed me to and fro.

I have to express my heartfelt appreciation as well to John Rapley for helping to facilitate my bid to experience life in post-Apartheid South Africa. The timely introduction he provided to the politically astute and engaging Donna Wheeler and her husband Tom made my 2016 Johannesburg stay quite fruitful. Likewise did the conversations with my former student Ntshadi Mofokeng who along with Christine Letts were among the first to bear through the process of me working through my initial ideas.

Lastly but certainly not least, I can hardly express gratitude enough to Nefer-titi and Baraka for understanding the sacrifices that had to be made. Thank you so much for bearing with me during the tribulations of the writing process when at times, although physically I was there, my mind wandered along those secret pathways into the hidden world of ideas.

Greg A. Graham
Norman, Oklahoman

Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

1 Introduction

Democratic Political Tragedy

It is fitting to speak of tragedy on the tail end of those defining moments where the hopes and aspirations encapsulated in important, progressive projects of the mid to late twentieth century and early twenty-first century were run aground. The language of tragedy captures and conveys effectively the deferred dreams and thwarted aspirations of so many who had entertained the possibility of effecting radical social transformation through the democratic process. Salient among their short-lived hopes was that the capture of the state and its institutions through adult suffrage would go a long way in helping to right the wrongs of the colonial enterprises that had preceded – the ravages from which they were emerging as postcolonial. In this sense, the principal tragedy that befell these popular projects in the shape of the neoliberal turn that cut off completely, or else severely impeded the path to more just social outcomes for those most vulnerable in postcolonial states, is suitably understood as *democratic political tragedy*. In this book I explore how this form of tragedy manifested in Jamaica during the 1970s with the Manley led experiment with democratic socialism as an alternative path to development. I consider in addition its more recent iteration in post-apartheid South Africa with the Nelson Mandela led African National Congress (ANC's) abandonment of the radical posture of the Freedom Charter for a neoliberal path to growth.¹

As the label implies, democratic political tragedy entails the stymieing of democratic possibilities, specifically the failure of the democratic process to bring into fruition the popular, progressive aspirations of an electorate made manifest in their exercise of the franchise. The tragic substance in such cases lies not only with the disappointment and frustration in the face of political outcomes that reinforce the status quo of adverse inequality and the marginalization of the historically disadvantaged. It lies also with the failure of genuinely democratic politics which, insofar it finds itself in harmony with popular, progressive aspirations, has acquired the highest grade ethical refinement attainable in the context of western modernity. The progressive political agenda in that context acquires its highest pedigree of ethical purchase, and thus substantial legitimacy. The real crux of democratic political tragedy lies in the passing of this pristine moment through a combination of the political failures mainly of a tragic democratic leadership figure who embodies the progressive effort, and the pressures brought

2 Introduction

to bear upon that project by the way that the state in which it is undertaken is situated in the global capitalist economy. To the extent that the progressive project ventures to improve the condition of the society as a whole, pursuing the interest of the body politic in its entirety instead of that of a parochial few, democratic political tragedy represents in effect a thwarting of an important dimension of what Jean Jacques Rousseau meant to designate by the notion of the *general will*.² It represents in this way what we might view through the lens that Frantz Fanon offers, as nothing short of the stymieing of *national consciousness*.³

Democratic political tragedy has four main components. First, it unfolds against the backdrop of the set of socio-political and economic circumstances that Achille Mbembe has labeled the *postcolony*.⁴ The label postcolony signals mainly the continuation of the colonial modus operandi following the withdrawal of the colonizing power from the formerly colonized zone. The most impactful aspect of this continuity obtains at the level of the political economy of the postcolony. Here, the character of this important dimension of the state's existence tends to remain largely in accordance with the external imperatives of colonial times past. Additionally, the continuity shows itself further in the enduring colonial character of rule and domination through which those in control of the state govern after the attainment of national independence. The exercise of political power in the postcolony becomes marked by the levels of excess and grandiosity that interest Mbembe in the degree to which they become banal and mundane features of everyday life in the state, and important technologies of domination through which political elites maintain their rule.⁵

There is, second, a progressive, popular political claim that has attained a degree of legitimacy, that in the modern world can come only through the democratic process. This claim, which in the context of the postcolony sets out to link the political freedom of citizens with their material well-being, is progressive insofar as its goal is ultimately to expand access to the social goods that make political freedom worthwhile to begin with. The desired effect, in short, is an increased access to a higher quality of life and freedom in the democratic state. To this end the progressive claim raises in the context of the postcolony disruptive questions such as those regarding the distribution of a society's resources conducive with just social outcomes.

The popular aspirations reflected in our progressive claim become tied up in the political fate of a democratically elected leader, our third component, who comes to be perceived as its embodiment. It happens that at a decisive political moment, this larger-than-life, charismatic figure, through indecisive vacillation in some instances and borderline collusion and capitulation in others, plays an important role in sending the progressive effort that has become heavily invested in him/her along its downward spiral. He/she is rendered thereby a tragic leader within the broader context of the framework suggested for democratic political tragedy. The limitations upon transformative efforts in lieu the state's place in the global capitalist economy makes it so that the tragic democratic leader emerges onto the political stage seemingly under an ill-fated star.

Democratic political tragedy is made manifest when the popular, progressive democratic claim comes up against opposition in the form of a competing claim.

This counter claim, our fourth component to democratic political tragedy, generally stresses, as being of the utmost importance, the imperative of national economic growth conceived of as feasible only through the immersion of the postcolony into the global economy within the traditional, exploitative, subordinate role inherited from colonialism. National growth is conceived of as feasible mainly within a neoliberal framework that as a matter of doctrine insists on the separation of questions about political freedom and social justice from those of the material circumstances of citizens in the state. In the end, the triumph of this counter claim and the disaster that befalls the popular, progressive enterprise means ultimately a compromise in the quality of freedom afforded in the post-colony, provided we accept as important to the enjoyment of social and political freedom the access citizens have to the material resources necessary for a meaningful quality of life. In their failure, such projects stand among the defining political disasters of our postcolonial age. Disasters and their victims as Jane and Lewis Gordon remind us, follow along a continuum. The victims themselves come to signal with foreboding the dire consequences of the failure to read signs and to heed divine warnings.⁶ As I show in Chapter 3 with my engagement with C. L. R. James and Frantz Fanon such warnings are a staple of the Radical Africana tradition.

Hegelian Foundations

The theory of democratic political tragedy as it is formulated here harkens to G. W. F. Hegel's understanding of tragedy mainly, but not exclusively, of the ancient type. It proceeds with an awareness of the important distinctions Hegel draws between the forms that ancient Greek tragedy might take in terms of the defining conflict at its center, and especially in terms of the corresponding forms that the resolution of those conflicts might take. Equally as important as these distinctions within ancient tragedy are features that set it apart from tragedy in its modern variation. What is important here for the understanding of Hegel's account of tragedy that shapes our own theory, is that it is not overdetermined by any one of the forms that he suggests tragedy might take, or by any one feature of the structure of ancient tragedy, as we shall see is often the case.

Democratic political tragedy derives its formal structure from the core sequence of development that can be gleaned from Hegel's account of tragedy in its ancient and modern forms. We can abstract from Hegel's account as it appears especially in *Phenomenology* and *Aesthetics*, a theory of tragedy in which catastrophic tension and conflict between competing ethical claims take center stage and find resolution in the end. In Hegel's account, the nature of the conflict at the heart of tragedy is decisive. His reflections on ancient tragedy in particular, highlight the importance of the substantive content of the tragic conflict. This substantive content informs his understanding of the aesthetic as well as philosophic significance of the genre. The genuinely tragic tension arises in circumstances where competing ethical claims, each valid in their own right, come into conflict. Given their shared claim to the right by virtue of their ethical

4 Introduction

substance, and given that the human beings who give them voice are limited in their grasp of the ethical whole in which they share a common place, there is mutual violation by each claim of the other, and the demand consequently that things be set right. The cost of this for the human subjects who give voice to the *pathos* in the tragic moment can prove to be a rather heavy burden to bear as we see in Sophocles' *Antigone*. In Hegel's account of tragedy, the tragic action moves mainly from this ethical contradiction to its denouement, and then to the resolution by which the *pathos* returns to the whole from which human subjectivity has torn it asunder. For their part, the audience that bears witness to tragic drama is resolved through it to the rationality of their political community which tragedy reaffirms.

This basic structure of Hegel's account of tragedy is recognized as offering insight into the misadventures of Spirit/Consciousness as it progresses toward the speculative unity that fuels his philosophical endeavors.⁷ The underlying configuration of the tragic conflict and its resolution, is reflected in a journey of consciousness from immediate knowledge, through the mediation that experience affords, eventually to higher, more refined forms of knowing. The limitations of a moment in the development of consciousness manifests as internal contradictions that are eventually overcome. That resolution, as we shall see, is not the finality of the matter however. The sequence, that we find reflected in tragedy, reveals to consciousness the previous limitations that bore down upon its initial apprehension of reality. These moments of *anagnorisis* and *peripeteia* for consciousness (of discovery and reversal, to borrow from Aristotle in the way that Theodore George discerns that Hegel ventures to do) are a source of anguish given the cocksure posture of certainty that it assumes at each stage.⁸ The tragic reversals by which consciousness is transformed from that which it was previously at each stage, are salient moments along what Hegel describes in *Phenomenology* as the way of despair.⁹

For its part, democratic political tragedy features a defining tension and ultimately a potentially paralyzing conflict between what I label politically valid claims. Of course, the idea of political validity stands in contrast with Hegel's concern with the ethical validity of the claims that find themselves in conflict in his theory of tragedy.¹⁰ In framing the central issue with the claims at stake in democratic political tragedy as that of their political validity I draw upon the form and structure of Hegel's theory of tragedy, but with a concern strictly for seminal political drama in the postcolony. I focus, for example, on the material conditions that constrain the choices political actors venture upon in the postcolony, and the calamities that spiral from them with serious ramifications for the body politic. I engage in other words in the creolization of Hegel's theory of tragedy and of the manner in which it shapes and elucidates his account of the state. Political experience as tragedy in the postcolony is read against these aspects of Hegel's thought to mutually illuminating effect. The lived political realities of conflict, struggle, and enduring fissures in the postcolony bears out our reading of the dialectical movement that underpins Hegel's theory of tragedy, and by implication his reading of the state as the form of political

association that comes into existence to overcome the limitations that mark the ethical moments of the family and of civil society as he describes them in *Philosophy of Right*.¹¹ That underlying dialectic is affirmed by the occurrences of democratic political tragedy to be open-ended more so in accordance with Left-Hegelian interpretations. The resolution of the conflict between competing claims which overdetermines Hegel's theory of tragedy in standard misreadings, and which becomes an impetus toward an understanding of the state as the ultimate resolution of all the conflicts and contradictions that preceded it, is shown by the ongoing political drama of the postcolony, to be simply another moment in the dialectic of social development that speculative reason as critical reflection reveals to us. In our critical reflection upon that salient moment of the postcolonial state that follows upon the heels of the struggle for national independence, and upon similarly foiled radical undertakings that sought to give real substance to the collective goods of freedom and national sovereignty, Africana thought for which democratic political tragedy is an instance, is actively engaged in the creolization of the tragic reversal that experience effects upon consciousness, according to Hegel. Our critical reflection from the aftermath of the radical democratic endeavors that concern us here represents a form of theorizing from the ruins of the postcolonial present, along with the recent effort of David Scott and of Jane and Lewis Gordon. It exposes for the radical imagination the limitations that weighed heavily upon its previous conceptions of struggle and change.¹²

It happens then that not every impasse or calamity with which the body politic finds itself beset constitutes a genuinely tragic political situation in the sense that democratic political tragedy implies. The notion is meant to speak to a certain pedigree of circumstance for which valid and essential political claims enter into mortal, zero-sum, myopic confrontation with each other in pursuit of the right, each with the intent to negate the other and to position itself as Absolute. We have herein the equivalent of what Hegel describes as the one-sidedness of the *pathos*. Generally, in the postcolony, the seminal, defining contradiction occurs between the imperatives of economic development and immersion in the global economy on the one hand, and of social justice and national sovereignty on the other. The subordinated role occupied by the postcolony in the global political economy creates a situation wherein the simultaneous pursuit of these otherwise intricately linked normative agendas is not without some difficulty.¹³ That subordination has been the concern of post and neo Marxist theories that have sought to draw attention to the structure of the global political economy, and the role played by different states and regions in its related processes of labor and the extraction of raw material on the one hand, and industrial production and hyper consumption of finished goods on the other.¹⁴

Acknowledging the role of this wider global context in democratic political tragedy requires that the limitations of Hegel's framing of the defining tension in ancient tragedy, almost exclusively around affairs within a political community, be overcome. It would seem that with Hegel, we have a somewhat limited sense of how the broader international context might impress upon the tragic conflict

and the manner of its resolution. One of the earliest efforts to rescue the importance of context for tragedy comes by way of Søren Kierkegaard's intervention. Kierkegaard took issue with the extreme subjectivity that defined modern tragedy (and the spirit of his age, to be sure), and made a case for the influence brought to bear by objective reality as essential to genuinely tragic action even in the modern period. A truly tragic situation contains an element of ambiguity, according to Kierkegaard. Therein, the question of whether it is the action of the protagonist or objective external factors that constitute the broader epic context for those actions which prove ultimately the decisive factor that brings about the alluring spectacle of his/her demise, remains always open.

In *Either/Or*, Kierkegaard raises for us the issue of the real nature of tragic guilt in order to show what is lacking about the kind of guilt that takes root in modern tragedy. In modern tragedy, the individual must bear the full burden of his/her choices and their ramifications as if he/she were not situated in a family, state, or wider historical context. "[M]odern tragedy has no epic foreground, no epic remainder. The hero stands and falls entirely on his own deeds."¹⁵ The result, says Kierkegaard, is that, "[c]onsequently his guilt is sin, his pain repentance, but thereby the tragic is canceled."¹⁶ On this account the scope for tragedy in Hegel's modern state is severely limited. From the standpoint of theoretical possibilities, Kierkegaard takes us beyond those limitations so that we are able to broach the issue of the way in which the conditions that shape political choices and action for developing states in the global political economy, contribute to democratic political tragedy. This, against the inclination to lay at the feet of the developing state the entirety of the blame for its plight in the modern world, a tendency not far removed from the very spirit of Kierkegaard's age that irked him so.

Democratic political tragedy takes into serious account then such factors as, structural adjustment policies that came in tandem with assistance from international monetary organizations during the 1960s and 1970s; the radical neo-liberal shift that begins in the early 1980s with the Margaret Thatcher regime in Great Britain and Ronald Reagan in the United States and the impact this had on the plight of small economies in the age of globalization and expanding markets; and finally the Washington Consensus of the late 1980s by which the above were streamlined as development imperatives for Third World states going into the twenty-first century. These factors are important in making the case for democratic political tragedy beyond the immediacy of the dialectic of confrontation at the domestic level. Through them the sort of tragedy to be explored comes to entail an element of the kind of suffering that is in keeping with the sense Kierkegaard argues for.

Shoni Rancher, citing Isak Winkel, points out where the Danish word for suffering used by Kierkegaard, *Liden*, has a double meaning. It indicates on the one hand the plight of enduring extreme discomfort, "but also, in a more grammatical sense of the word, to be a passive object of an action, just as 'to suffer' in old English can mean to be acted upon...."¹⁷ Inasmuch as the substantive institutions of family and state continue to bear upon Kierkegaard's modern tragic subject,

the global political economy and the roles designated in it provide the epic context for democratic political tragedy for the developing nation in the international context. This broader epic context makes it possible for us to conceive of the extent to which tragic action that is brought into focus with democratic political tragedy is one repeated across space and time, in the sense of infinite recurrence, beginning with the political dilemmas of the Haitian Revolution that James draws our attention to.

It is against the backdrop of the postcolony's precarious role in the global economy that the competing claims that generally feature in democratic political tragedy come to be articulated as mutually exclusive. Its subordinated role and susceptibility to external imperatives compromises projects that prioritize distributive and restitutive forms of justice and national sovereignty. Thus, the claims I have identified thus far find themselves situated in tragic diametric opposition to each other. We bear witness as such, to the coming to a head of rigid, intractable positions in the turmoil of political struggle, that ranges from the clamor of competing discourses to more violent and deadly enterprises. In either case all parties in their one-sidedness lose sight of the political worth embodied in rival claims. Mutual violation in this zero-sum engagement is as such assured by the debilitating atmosphere that prevails at pivotal moments in the political development of the postcolony. The discourse ethics that is essential for the persistence of life in the political association is scarcely to be found at such moments of disjuncture. What exists in its stead is only the blinding indignation toward a perceived dangerously misguided *other* in face of whom any moral obligation or ethical demand requisite for meaningful dialogue evaporates. The protagonists in democratic political tragedy proceed in the bliss of dogmatic self-certainty, deaf to a host of admonitions writ large against the pages that chronicle the postcolonial experience up to the present.

Democratic Political Tragedy in Action

The historical episodes that make for democratic political tragedy as I have outlined it thus far are, first, the thwarting of the democratic socialist project undertaken by the Michael Manley led People's National Party (PNP) in Jamaica over the course of the 1970s.¹⁸ And second, the transition to rigid neoliberal dictates in the quest for a macro-economic policy conducive with the search for more just social outcomes in the post-apartheid era in South Africa. The latter episode begins to take shape during the Tripartite Alliance spearheaded by the Nelson Mandela led ANC.¹⁹

In the case of Jamaica under Manley there is a clear Hegelian dialectic of opposition at the heart of the tragic political episode. Here the progressive socialist project of the Manley led PNP administration over the course of the 1970s comes into conflict with the neoliberal political agenda of the Edward Seaga led Jamaica Labour Party (JLP). With a political agenda rooted in its espoused capitalist, neoliberal identity, the JLP presented itself as the political and ideological antithesis of the PNP. It largely eschewed the latter party's socialist leanings and

posture toward non-alignment and thus strategic neutrality in the East–West divide shaped by the Cold War. The JLP unabashedly aligned itself with the West, and in particular with the interests of the United States. It thus eschewed as well the PNP’s ideological commitment to the pursuit of social and economic justice on the local and well as the global stage. From the JLP’s perspective, the Manley regime’s attempt at a mixed economy in which private sector investment supplemented state directed growth, was woefully misguided. National growth from the perspective of the JLP came to be envisioned as possible only through the kind of macro-economic policy that was consistent with the standard dictates of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and World Bank. As is still currently the case, these multilateral lending institutions tended to prescribe heavy doses of structural adjustment policies for developing nations. These policies entail a bitter cocktail of rationalizing policy measures such as currency devaluation, economic divestment, and reductions in social investment in order for the state to be more capable of servicing the loans secured from the lending agencies.

In Jamaica, the tragic tension between the PNP and JLP, between Manley and Seaga, took the form of competing political claims each situated in Cold War ideological dictum and articulated in a way that disregarded the political worth and relevance of the other for national development. In its more extreme manifestation this disjoint was marked by levels of political violence not seen since in the history of the fledging nation-state. In 1980, the year of Manley’s ousting and the ascendancy of neoliberal designs in Jamaica and the Caribbean as a whole, Jamaica recorded its bloodiest election for which a conservative total 844 politically related murders have been estimated.²⁰ The outcome of that election was the political demise of Manley and with him the decline in purchase of progressive politics at the macro level. The purchase of politics of the sort has not since recovered. Manley’s return to the office of Prime Minister in 1988 was marked by his noteworthy abandonment of the radical albeit Fabian socialist leaning that had shaped his political identity and attracted to him the large, enthusiastic mass of those traditionally marginalized in Jamaican society. There was as well, in conjunction with this conspicuous ideological retreat, the peculiar way in which the public policy of the PNP came to mirror that of the JLP so that both were in accord with neoliberal imperatives going into the 1990s. The Thatcherite adage of the 1980s “there is no alternative” (TINA), became political reality in Jamaica in the way the ideological and policy limitations of party politics shaped democratic participation from the 1990s onward.

South Africa’s misadventures in its quest for economic development in the early post-apartheid era presents us with a similarly intriguing case of democratic political tragedy. The primary dialectic of opposition in the South African case manifested within the African National Congress (ANC), and within the broader Tripartite Alliance that it made up, along with the South African Communist Party (SACP) and the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). The post-apartheid, South African iteration of the postcolony saw the rise of a dominant party system in which the ANC held sway over the Alliance and therefore over the character of public policy that issued from it. During

the period under consideration the content of the fledgling nation's macro-economic policy shaped mainly by ANC directives came to reflect the degree of ideological contestation between the adherents to the longstanding radical vision of a free state that had for decades sustained the struggle against Apartheid, and an ascendant technocratic, neoliberal agenda. This tension and the eventual triumph of the neoliberal ethos under the cloak of pragmatism can be seen in the rapid shift from the Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP) to Growth Empowerment and Redistribution (GEAR) as the new South African government searched for the configuration of political economy most conducive to rapid growth and at the same time social justice.

The ill-fated progressive project at stake in this case of democratic political tragedy then was none other than the grand vision of the post-apartheid state that had been shaped in the trenches of struggle and given its clearest articulation in the Freedom Charter of 1955. The Freedom Charter was the final product of a broad referendum into the main components of a free society as envisioned by those who aspired to be its citizens. Among its declarations were, that the land of South Africa be shared among those who work it, that the national wealth of the country be transferred to its people, and that citizens be entitled to a living wage and to less working hours.²¹ From 1955 to 1994 the Charter was understood to set the parameters of a radical transformative democratic project that would replace the anti-democratic, dehumanizing repression of Apartheid and right the wrongs of despotic minority rule. It outlined the main changes necessary to actualize the progressive nationalist project and captured the radical imagination of the vast majority of South Africa's disenfranchised black population.

In the period leading up to the end of Apartheid the ANC with its broad support and international renown came to be perceived guardians of this radical vision inscribed in the Charter. Like the charismatic Manley in the Jamaican case, Mandela managed to capture the imagination of people around the world who dreamt of radical alternatives for post-apartheid South African society. The abandonment of the principles outlined by the Freedom Charter in 1994 and their replacement by the centrist dictates of the RDP under Mandela's stewardship of the newly formed post-apartheid state was a significant blow to all those heavily invested in the progressivist dream of a truly free society. While it held a posture toward maintaining some of the principles of the Freedom Charter, the RDP revealed the constraints brought to bear by South Africa's traditional role in the global economy as a producer mainly of raw materials, and therefore its heightened vulnerability to the ebb and flow of global capital investments. In the face of the threat of capital flight the aspiration toward democratic ownership and control of the country's wealth was first to be abandoned. The ANC would declare eventually that any material foundation upon which a response to the pressing demands for social and economic justice would be based had to come from post-apartheid economic growth. This neoliberal posture by the party signaled in effect that the distribution of wealth and resources that Apartheid begat would in effect remain largely intact. The position, which was affirmed in the

rapid sequence that led from the RDP to GEAR, would have serious implications for the pursuit of distributive and restitutive forms of justice in South Africa after 1994.

Despite its nominal posture toward the ideal of redistribution GEAR was resolutely neoliberal in terms of its content and signaled the ANC's and the Tripartite Alliance's rupture with the radical aspirations that had sustained and given legitimacy to the struggle for freedom and majority rule. The tragic dimension of this development was deepened by the fact that not only had the progressive tendencies inside the ANC been overtaken, the other political organizations within the Tripartite Alliance, the SACP and Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU) became co-opted. These latter two organizations were traditionally the standard bearers of radical, transformative social ideology in South African politics. Their strategic containment through their place in the Alliance meant that the field of political alternatives necessary for substantive democratic contestation in South Africa was effectively limited.

We have for our case studies then two tragic episodes at the center of which stand two democratically elected, tragic political leaders. Both these instances of democratic political tragedy represent important junctures in the looping drama of postcolonial struggle that began with Haitian independence.²² At these important junctures in the twentieth century the underlying Hegelian character of tragic confrontation – between the imperatives of just social outcomes, particularly of the distributive sort, and those of economic development conceived of within the rigid epistemic confines of neoliberal ideological dictums of immersion in the global capitalist economy – appears in its more refined form. The episodes are formally tragic to the extent that they share this peculiar dialectic of opposition in which viable political claims that under normal circumstances would be recognized for their mutual relevance and political worth are articulated each as exclusive in their respective claim to right as far as the well-being of the postcolony is concerned. In both instances, the designated role of the postcolony in the vast network of extraction, production, and consumption that is the global capitalist economy exacerbates the tension between the expansion of substantive freedom across the body politic on the one hand, and the imperatives of a global market economy largely ill-disposed to this ideal on the other.

In addition to the formal structure of the political conflict and the manner of its resolution that they involve, the episodes are tragic also to the degree that they each have as a central feature the failure of progressive projects. Prior to their collapse these projects had about them a degree of legitimacy and ethical purchase that in the modern world comes only when the democratic process gives sanction to popular, radical aspirations. In both case studies to be undertaken then, in Jamaica under Manley and South Africa under Mandela, we observe where the democratic process becomes the avenue through which a scarce moment of the sort of unanimity Fanon means to indicate by the label *national consciousness* emerges and adds the force of legitimacy to a popular progressive project of great import.²³ What the tragic episodes comes to represent in this sense is a stymieing of genuine democratic possibilities that in each case

sought to link political freedom to the material condition of citizens in the state, via the just distribution of social and material goods. The neoliberal *modus operandi* that in each case upends these projects strives to keep these variables separate and apart from each other both in theory and in practice.

For its part, the nature of that project as progressive reflects in the extent to which, consistent with the substance of *national consciousness*, the democratic process that brings it into being represents a genuine moment in which the political community suspends particular and parochial interests in order to derive the *general will*, the objective interests of the community as a whole.²⁴ Manley's democratic socialist project in Jamaica over the course of the 1970s, and the initial gestures in the direction of an arrangement of political economy that would directly address the structural inequalities fostered by racial apartheid in South Africa following Mandela's election to office in 1994, both represent unique moments where popular, progressive projects are granted that refinement of political and moral legitimacy that becomes the democratic mandate. To this extent, they become also within the context of the postcolony, moments in which we observe the re-inscribing of *national consciousness*. Understandably, much significance is therefore attached to the thwarting of collective social and political efforts that take shape under such auspices. What is at stake, with the triumph of neoliberal enterprises that foil them, is after all nothing short of the collective, objective well-being of the political community. Insofar as the radical individualism at its core is antithetical to communitarianism, neoliberalism in the context of the postcolony is inconsistent with the demands of *national consciousness*.

Manley and Mandela become tragic political leaders against this broader context. It is thus that they play their leading roles in episodes that saw the foundering of mass democratic mobilization aimed at effecting radical social transformation. Both leaders came to embody as such the aspirations of previously marginalized and racialized majorities. They are tragic figures furthermore insofar as they bear responsibility for some of the missteps and vacillations that further compounded the unfortunate set of circumstances that resulted in their political demise. It happens that the compromises they were willing to make in each instance ran counter to the vision of democratic fugitivity inscribed in the popular understanding and expectations of the respective liberatory projects that they each came to embody, for the host of ordinary people who became heavily invested. In a sense their sovereign vision of marronage, as Neil Roberts conceptualizes it, ran afoul of, and compromised the epistemic vision of flight implicit in *national consciousness*, when it manifests as important moments of unanimity in which the body politic declares what it deems to be the genuine collective interest of the political community as a whole.²⁵ As tragic figures Manley and Mandela bring us past the dialectic of conflict that ancient tragedy elucidates, and into the modern variations for which the questions of inner conflict, vacillations, choices and motives loom large.

My purpose in the next chapter (Chapter 2) will be to begin to situate democratic political tragedy and the character of radical democratic politics that it

entails, within a Left-Hegelian reading of Hegel's account of tragedy that is understood as having implications for his reading of the state as an ethical moment. The aim is to situate the theory of democratic political tragedy beyond the limiting, deterministic accounts of Hegel's reading of tragedy that restrict it, and by extension his political philosophy to the theme of *resolution*. Accounts of this sort tend to read the emergence of the state in Hegel as the moment in which all the tensions and contradictions leading up to it are supposedly resolved. One of the main aims in this second chapter in light of this tendency is to make the case for a more open-ended reading the dialectical movement that underlines Hegel's theory of tragedy and the aspects of his political thought that I focus on. The chapter makes the case at the same time for the kind of political experience that concerns us, for democratic political tragedy to be seen as *tragedy* in a real, true sense. Drawing upon David Scott's recent attempts in *Conscripts of Modernity* and *Omens of Adversity* to engage with Caribbean revolution as tragedy, I argue in the spirit of Fanon that the radical undertakings, through the democratic process in Jamaica and South Africa to which we draw attention, represented similarly disruptive upsurges from the zone of non-being. In their own way they ultimately did violence to the prevailing order of things in contexts marked by oppression and systemic inequality.²⁶ The political enterprises that provide our case studies are presented in this sense as no less tragic than the instances of revolution that are often theorized as such.

Chapter 3 attempts to build upon the theoretical grounding offered in the second chapter by locating democratic political tragedy in the very important and rapidly emerging trend among political theorists and philosophers of creolizing the canonical figures in their respective fields. This, scholars like Jane Gordon, Neil Roberts, Paget Henry, and Michael Monahan accomplish, by reading canonical philosophers and thinkers against the philosophy, theory, and the lived realities of people from the global south, which as a whole was scarcely considered when many of the definitive works in these disciplines were conceived.²⁷ Creolization as an analytic operation and as methodology is understood in this effort as bi-directional in terms of the revelation and insight that it affords. It is recognized for its mutually transformative effect upon the manner in which we interpret instances of canonical thought, and the instances either of theory or of socio-political experience from the global south alongside which they are read. Democratic political tragedy follows in the tendency detected in Fanon of creolizing Hegel's theory of tragedy, and with this his broader philosophical account of the development of consciousness from its immediate stages to absolute knowing as a higher form of awareness. Fanon's reading of the anti-colonial revolution and the political reality that it gives rise to in its wake, through the lens that Hegel affords, highlights the tragic configuration of the struggle for national independence and the implications of this for the postcolonial state, as the outcome of that effort. The account of Hegel offered thereby is heretic, given that the subjects of Fanon's concern were deemed as standing outside of history from the ethnocentric world view that informed Hegel's attempt to theorize. Their experience with the post-colonial state nevertheless can be read as illuminating in quite an interesting way,

the popular misreading of the state for Hegel as the final moment of grand, triumphant overcoming and enlightenment. The postcolony continues to be a site of conflict that renders the enlightenment of national independence defunct and confirms how far the journey of consciousness and the work of experience is never quite done.

Chapter 4 will offer a reading of the Michael Manley administration of Jamaica over the period 1972–1980 through the lens provided by the theory of democratic political tragedy. It will highlight the more progressive features of his political agenda that resonated with so many Jamaicans in a country that, by 1972, was only a decade removed from colonial status and consequently afflicted by social and economic inequalities, as well as by the restrictions that came with its designation as a hinterland of extraction – to borrow from the Plantation School variation of Dependency Theory. The manner in which the opposition to his agenda was articulated at the local level provides the structural framework for this as an instance of democratic political tragedy. Manley, as the tragic figure central to this instance of political drama, will be sculpted in relief against this backdrop. Consideration will be given to his noble intentions, but also to his indecision and his telling vacillations, that had dire consequences for so many at home and abroad who found themselves heavily invested in his political project.

Chapter 5 will demonstrate how political tragedy manifested in the case of South Africa with its search for the most suitable configuration of macro-economic policy by which to secure economic growth and at the same time address (or evade, or even delay) the question of distributive justice in the wake of Apartheid. The formal structure of the iconic conflict that makes for democratic political tragedy will be shown as manifesting within the internal dynamics of the Tripartite Alliance that has governed South Africa since 1994. Stress will be placed on the place of Nelson Mandela in this debacle as the tragic political leadership figure who is emblematic of the thwarted aspirations the majority of the black South African population, and the stifled political possibilities at the heart of the episode.

Chapter 6 raises briefly for consideration the immediate aftermath of the two instances of democratic political tragedy covered in Chapter 4 and Chapter 5. Here the subjects of concern will be, each briefly, the Percival James Patterson regime that comes immediately after Manley in Jamaica and the Thabo Mbeki regime that follows Mandela in South Africa. Both cases are symbolic as well as concrete representations of the momentary triumph of the neoliberal designs they entail over the popular democratic aspirations of the political moments that immediately preceded them. We encounter in both cases, in the immediate aftermath of the tragic failure of progressive politics, political leaders whose devotion to the tenets of neoliberal development as a way out of the economic malaise take on pseudo religious attributes. The chapter will theorize, via these developments, the extension of the tragic element in democratic political tragedy beyond the formal structure of conflict and into the content of everyday existence in the postcolony. I conclude with a reflection on the meaning of democratic political tragedy for those who stand within its aftermath and are yet

14 Introduction

courageous enough to persist in taking seriously the unceasing struggle for human freedom and dignity that has to be waged through political engagement.

Notes

- 1 Of course, the case might easily be made for democratic political tragedy beyond the postcolony. One could make the case for considering in this light proposed here the Obama administration in the U.S. and its aftermath. That however is beyond the scope of the current work
- 2 Jean Jacques Rousseau, *The Social Contract*, London: Penguin Classics, 1968. See additionally Jane A. Gordon's engagement with Rousseau's idea of the general will in, Jane A. Gordon, *Creolizing Political Theory: Reading Rousseau through Fanon*, New York: Fordham University Press, 2012
- 3 Frantz Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth*, New York: Grove Press, 1963; Lewis R. Gordon, *An Introduction to Africana Philosophy*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008, p. 83; Jane A. Gordon, op. cit.
- 4 See Achille Mbembe, *On the Postcolony*, Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2001
- 5 Ibid.; see also, Achille Mbembe, "Provisional Notes on the Postcolony," *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute* 62 (1) (1992): 3–37
- 6 Jane A. Gordon and Lewis R. Gordon, *Of Divine Warning: Reading Disaster in the Modern Age*, Boulder and London: Paradigm Publishers, 2009
- 7 Theodore D. George, *Tragedies of Spirit: Tracing Finitude in Hegel's Phenomenology*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 2006
- 8 See, Aristotle, *Poetics*, in Richard McKeon, ed., *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, New York: The Modern Library, 2001; Theodore D. George, *Tragedies of Spirit: Tracing Finitude in Hegel's Phenomenology*, Albany: State University of New York Press, 2006
- 9 G. W. F. Hegel *Phenomenology of Spirit*, trans. A. V. Miller, Oxford, New York, Toronto, and Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 1977, p. 49
- 10 It is useful to recall that for Hegel the ethical disposition, which is resolute, self-assured, and final in its claim to moral validity emerges within the context of the onset of social relations beginning with the family, and then civil society and the state in accordance with the sequence encountered in his *Philosophy of Right*. In his *Phenomenology of Spirit* he declares:

Ethical disposition consists just in sticking to what is right and abstaining from all attempts to move or shake it, or derive it.... It is not, therefore because I find something is not self-contradictory that it is right; on the contrary, it is right because it is what is right....

The claims that come into conflict in political tragedy are usually undertaken with a similar degree of conviction and zeal

- 11 G. W. F. Hegel, *Philosophy of Right*, London: George Bell and Sons, 1896
- 12 See David Scott, *Conscripts of Modernity: The Tragedy of Colonial Enlightenment*, Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004; David Scott, *Omens of Adversity: Tragedy, Time, Memory, Justice*, Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press, 2014; Jane A. Gordon and Lewis R. Gordon, *Of Divine Warning: Reading Disaster in the Modern Age*, Boulder and London: Paradigm Publishers, 2009
- 13 In his recent political profile of the Antiguan statesman Vic Bird, Paget Henry has shown just how problematic this bifurcation can be for the plight of developing nations. The limits to the generation of substantial home-grown, independent capital investments meant that in the interest of maintaining national sovereignty and avoiding the IMF conditionalities Bird was led down rather shady paths that tainted his image. See Paget Henry, *Shouldering Antigua and Barbuda: The Life of V.C. Bird*, London: Hansib, 2010

Introduction

- Aristotle. 2001. "Poetics." In *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, edited by Richard McKeon, 1455–1487. New York: The Modern Library.
- Beckford, George. 1972. *Persistent Poverty: Underdevelopment in the Plantation Economies of the Third World*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Best, Lloyd. 1972. "Outline of a Model of Pure Plantation Economy." *Social and Economic Studies* 17 (3): 283–326.
- Fanon, Frantz. 1963. *The Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press.
- George, Theodore. 2006. *Tragedies of Spirit: Tracing Finitude in Hegel's Phenomenology*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Gordon, Jane A. 2012. *Creolizing Political Theory: Reading Rousseau through Fanon*. New York: Fordham University Press.
- Gordon, Jane A., and Lewis R. Gordon. 2009. *Of Divine Warning: Reading Disaster In The Modern Age*. Boulder and London: Paradigm Publishers.
- Gordon, Lewis R. 2008. *Introduction to Africana Philosophy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hegel, G. W. F. 1896. *Philosophy of Right*. Translated by S. W. Dyde. London: George Bell and Sons.
- Hegel, G. W. F. 1977. *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Translated by A. V. Miller. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Helps, H. G. 2012. "The Bloody Election That Changed Jamaica." *Jamaica Observer*, October 30.
- Henry, Paget. 2010. *Shouldering Antigua and Barbuda: The Life of V.C. Bird*. London: Hansib.
- James, C. L. R. 1989. *The Black Jacobins*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Keith, Nelson W., and Novella Z. Keith. 1992. *The Social Origins of Democratic Socialism in Jamaica*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Kierkegaard, Søren. 1987. *Either/Or*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Levitt, Kari. 2005. *Reclaiming Development: Independent Thought and the Caribbean Community*. Kingston: Ian Randle Publishers.
- Mbembe, Achille. 1992. "Provisional Notes on the Postcolony." *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute* 62 (1): 3–37.
- Rodney, Walter. 2011. *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa*. Baltimore, MD: Black Classic Press.
- Rousseau, Jean Jacques. 1968. *The Social Contract*. London: Penguin Classics.
- Scott, David. 2004. *Conscripts of Modernity: The Tragedy of Colonial Enlightenment*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Scott, David. 2014. *Omens of Adversity: Tragedy, Time, Memory, Justice*. Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press.
- Wallerstein, Immanuel. 2011. *The Modern World System I: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century*. Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press.

Thinking with Hegel

- Aristotle. 2001. "Poetics." In *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, edited by Richard McKeon, 1455–1487. New York: The Modern Library.
- Baker, Derek W. M. 2009. *Tragedy and Citizenship: Conflict, Reconciliation, and Democracy from Haemon to Hegel*. New York: State University of New York Press.
- Cristi, F. R. 1989. "Hegel's Conservative Liberalism." *Canadian Journal of Political Science (Canadian Philosophical Association)* 22 (4): 717–738.
- Dash, Michael. 1998. *The Other America: Caribbean Literature in a New World Context*. Charlottesville and London: University Press of Virginia.

Fanon, Frantz. 1967. *Toward The African Revolution*. Monthly Review Press.

Fanon, Frantz. 1986. *Black Skin White Masks*. London: Pluto Press.

George, Theodore. 2006. *Tragedies of Spirit: Tracing Finitude in Hegel's Phenomenology*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Gibson, Nigel. 2003. *Fanon: The Postcolonial Imagination*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1975. *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art*. Translated by T. M. Knox . Vol. II. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1977. *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Translated by A. V. Miller . New York: Oxford University Press.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1991. *The Encyclopaedia Logic*. Translated by T. F. Gerates , W. A. Suchting , and H. S. Harris . Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing Company Inc.

Hegel, G. W. F. 2000. "Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences." In *The Idea of Race*, edited by Robert Bernasconi and Tommy L. Lott . Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing Company Inc.

Hegel, G. W. F. 2001. *Philosophy of History*. Translated by J. Sibree . Kitchener, ON: Batoche Book.

James, C. L. R. 1989. *The Black Jacobins*. New York: Vintage Books.

Meeks, Brian. 1993. *Caribbean Revolutions and Revolutionary Theory: An Assessment of Cuba, Nicaragua and Grenada*. London: Macmillan.

Monahan, Michael , ed. 2017. *Creolizing Hegel (Creolizing the Canon)*. London: Rowan & Littlefield International.

Paolucci, Anne. 1964. "Bradley and Hegel on Shakespeare." *Comparative Literature* 16 (3): 2011–2225.

Patten, Alan. 2002. *Hegel's Idea of Freedom*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Scott, David. 2004. *Conscripts of Modernity: The Tragedy of Colonial Enlightenment*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Scott, David. 2014. *Omens of Adversity: Tragedy, Time, Memory, Justice*. Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press.

Shakespeare, William. n.d. *Hamlet*. In *The Complete Works of William Shakespeare (Vol. II)*, edited by W. G. Clarke and Aldis Wright . Garden City, NY: Nelson Doubleday, Inc.

Creolizing Hegel's Theory of Tragedy

*

Baker, Derek W. M. 2009. *Tragedy and Citizenship: Conflict, Reconciliation, and Democracy from Haemon to Hegel*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Danto, Arthur C. 1999. *Hegel's End-of-Art Thesis*. www.rae.com.pt/Danto%20hegel%20end%20art.pdf.

Fanon, Frantz. 1963. *The Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press.

Fanon, Frantz. 1986. *Black Skin White Masks*. London: Pluto Press.

George, Theodore. 2006. *Tragedies of Spirit: Tracing Finitude in Hegel's Phenomenology*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Gibson, Nigel. 2003. *Fanon: The Postcolonial Imagination*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Gordon, Jane A. 2012. *Creolizing Political Theory: Reading Rousseau through Fanon*. New York: Fordham University Press.

Gordon, Lewis R. 1995. *Fanon and the Crisis of European Man: An Essay on Philosophy and the Human Sciences*. New York and London: Routledge.

Gordon, Lewis R. , and T. Denean Sharpley-Whiting . 1996. *Fanon: A Critical Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1886. *The Introduction to Hegel's Philosophy of Fine Art*. Translated by Benard Bosanquet. London: Kegan Paul, Trench & Co.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1920. *Philosophy of Fine Art*. Translated by F. P. B. Osmaston . London: G. Bell and Sons Ltd.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1975. *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art*. Translated by T. M. Knox . Vol. 2. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hegel, G. W. F. 1977. *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Translated by A. V. Miller . New York: Oxford University Press.

James, C. L. R. 1989. *The Black Jacobins*. New York: Vintage Books.

Paolucci, Anne , and Henry Paolucci . 2001. *Hegel on Tragedy*. Boston, MA: Griffon House Publications.

Rousseau, Jean Jacques. 1968. *The Social Contract*. London: Penguin Classics.

Sekyi-Otu, Ato. 1996. *Fanon's Dialectic of Experience*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Sharpley-Whiting, T. Denean. 1998. *Frantz Fanon: Conflicts and Feminisms*. Lanham: Rowan & Littlefield Publishers.

Manley's Jamaica

Agreement with Bauxite/Alumina Industry. n.d. Government Of Jamaica, Ministry Paper No. 46.

Beckford, George , and Michael Witter . 1980. *Small Garden Bitter Weed: The Political Economy of Struggle and Change in Jamaica*. Morant Bay: Maroon Publishing.

Benitez-Rojo, Antonio. 1996. *The Repeating Island: The Caribbean and the Postmodern Perspective*. 2nd Edition. Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press.

Césaire, Aimé. 1969. *The Tragedy of King Christophe*. Translated by Ralph Manbeim . New York: Grove Press.

Eaton, George. 1962. "Trade Union Development in Jamaica." *Caribbean Quarterly* 8 (1): 43–53.

Edie, Carlene J. 1991. *Democracy by Default: Dependency and Clientelism in Jamaica*. Bolder and London: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Gordon, Jane A. 2012. *Creolizing Political Theory: Reading Rousseau through Fanon*. New York: Fordham University Press.

Gordon, Lewis R. 1995. *Bad Faith and Anti-Black Racism*. Amherst, NY: Prometheus Book.

Gordon, Lewis R. 1997. *Her Majesty's Other Children: Sketches of Racism from a Neocolonial Age*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Gray, Obika. 1991. *Radicalism and Social Change in Jamaica, 1960–1972*. Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press.

James, C. L. R. 1984. *At The Rendezvous of Victory*. London: Allison & Busby.

James, C. L. R. 1989. *The Black Jacobins*. New York: Vintage Books.

Johnson, Marguerite , Bernard Diedrich , and McWhirter William . 1980. "Jamaica: Voting Under the Gun." *Time Magazine*, November 10.

Kaplan, Irving et al., ed. 1976. *Area Handbook for Jamaica*. Washington, DC: American University Press.

Kaufman, Michael. 1985. *Jamaica under Manley: Dilemmas of Socialism and Democracy*. London: Zed Books.

Keith, Nelson W. , and Novella Z. Keith . 1992. *The Social Origins of Democratic Socialism in Jamaica*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Ledgister, F. S. J. 2014. *Michael Manley and Jamaican Democracy, 1972–1980: The Word is Love*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.

Levitt, Kari. 2005. *Reclaiming Development: Independent Thought and the Caribbean Community*. Kingston: Ian Randle Publishers.

Lewis, Rupert. 1988. *Marcus Garvey: Anti-Colonial Champion*. Teaneck, NJ: Africa World Press.

Lindsay, Louis. 2005. "Myth of Independence: Middle Class Politics and Non-Mobilization in Jamaica." Working Paper No. 6, Sir Arthur Lewis Institute of Social and Economic Studies (SALISES), Mona, Kingston: University of the West Indies.

Mandle, J. R. 1996. *Persistent Underdevelopment: Change and Economic Modernization in the West Indies*. Hamilton, NY: Colgate University Press.

Manley, Michael. 1987. *Up the Down Escalator: Development and the International Economy, A Jamaican Case Study*. Washington, DC: Howard University Press.

Mars, Perry. 1998. *Ideology and Change: The Transformation of the Caribbean Left*. Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press.

Munroe, Trevor. 1972. *The Politics of Constitutional Decolonization: Jamaica*. Mona: Institute of Social and Economic Research, University of the West Indies.

New York Times. 1980. "Jamaica Campaign Going On Amid Rising Violence." July 12.

New York Times. 1980. "Opposition Candidate in Jamaica Survives an Ambush on Motorcade." October 1980: A3.

New York Times. 1980. "Deliverance in Jamaica." November 5: A30.

Payne, Anthony J. 1988. *Politics in Jamaica*. London: C. Hurst & Co. (Publishers) Ltd.

Payne, Anthony. 1991. "Jamaican Society and the Testing of Democracy." In *Society and Politics in the Caribbean*, edited by Colin Clarke. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Post, Ken. 1978. *Arise Ye Starvelings: The Jamaica Labour Rebellion of 1938 and Its Aftermath*. Boston: Nijhoff.

Roberts, Neil. 2015. *Freedom as Marronage*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.

Rose, Euclid A. 2005. *Dependency and Socialism in the Modern Caribbean: Superpower Intervention in Guyana, Jamaica and Grenada, 1970–1985*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.

Stephens, Evelyne Huber and John D. Stephens. 1986. *Democratic Socialism in Jamaica: The Political Movement and Social Transformation in Dependent Capitalism*. London: Macmillan.

Stone, Carl. 1979. "The 1976 Parliamentary Elections in Jamaica." *Caribbean Studies* 1 (1/2): 33–50.

Stone, Carl. 1980. *Democracy and Clientelism in Jamaica*. Oxford: Transaction Books.

Stone, Carl. 1985. "Jamaica in Crisis: From Socialist to Capitalist Management." *International Journal* 40 (2): 282–311.

Thame, Maziki. 2011. "Against Black Nationalism: The Rise of Black Power in Jamaica in Early Independence (1960–1980)." *Journal of Liberty Hall: The Legacy of Marcus Garvey* 2: 7–22.

The Daily Gleaner. 1980. "Shearer Wounded on Way to Rally." July 26.

Vassel, Linnette. 1995. "Women of the Masses: Daphne Campbell and 'Left' Politics in Jamaica in the 1950s." In *Engendering History: Caribbean Women in Historical Perspective*, edited by Verene Shepherd, Bridget Brereton, and Barbara Bailey. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Waters, Anita M. 1999. *Race, Class and Political Symbols: Rastafari and Reggae in Jamaican Politics*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers.

Mandela and the Tragedy of the Post-Apartheid State

Blumenfeld, Jesmond. 1997. "From Icon to Scapegoat: The Experience of South Africa's Reconstruction and Development Programme." *Development Policy Review* 15: 65–91.

Boehmer, Elleke. 2008. *Nelson Mandela: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.

"Congress Youth League Manifesto." 1994. Provisional Committee of the Congress Youth League.

Conrin, Jeremy. 1997. "Why the SACP Won't Jive to Gear." *Mail & Guardian Online*, June 20.

Department of Finance, Republic of South Africa. n.d. *Growth, Employment and Redistribution: A Macro-Economic Strategy*. Pretoria: www.treasury.gov.za/publications/other/gear/chapters.pdf.

DuBois, W. E. B. 1982. *The Souls of Black Folk*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Fanon, Frantz. 1963. *The Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press.

Getz, Arlene. 1994. "ANC Steers off Socialist Road; Countdown to a New South Africa." *Sydney Morning Herald*, April 19, 2013.

Gibson, Nigel C. 2011. *Fanonian Practices in South Africa: From Steve Biko to Abahlali baseMjondolo*. Scottsville, SA: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.

Gordon, Jane A. , and Lewis R. Gordon . 2009. *Of Divine Warning: Reading Disaster in the Modern Age*. Boulder, CO and London: Paradigm Publishers.

Gumede, William Mervin. 2007. *Thabo Mbeki and the Battle for the Soul of the ANC*. Cape Town: Zebra Press.

Hirsch, Alan. 2005. *Season of Hope: Economic Reform under Mandel and Mbeki*. Scottsville, CA: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press.

Hoogeveen, Johannes G. 2007. "Not Separate, Not Equal: Poverty and Inequality in Post-Apartheid South Africa." *Economic Development and Cultural Change* (The University of Chicago Press) 55 (3).

Ka'Nkosi, Sechaba. 1997. "Solidarity in Opposition to Gear." *Mail & Guardian*, September 19.

Leibbrandt, Murray , Ingrid Woolard , and Aden Finn , and Johnathan Argent . n.d. "Trends in South African Income Distribution and Poverty since the Fall of Apartheid." *OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Papers*, No. 101, OECD Publishing, © OECD.

Lembede, A. M. 1944. "Mr. Lembede Replies." *Inkeulueko*, September 23.

Lembede, A. M. 1945. "Fallacy of Non-European Unity Movement." *Bantu World*, August.

Lembede, A. M. 1945. "National Unity among Africans." *Ilangalase Natal*, October 6.

Lembede, A. M. 1945. "Some Basic Principles of African Nationalism." *Ilangalase Natal*, February 24.

Lewis, Paul. 1994. "World Market; Moderation Plays Well in Johannesburg." *New York Times*, November 13.

Limb, Peter. 2008. *Nelson Mandela*. Connecticut and London: Greenwood Press.

Lodge, Tom. 2006. *Mandela: A Critical Life*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Mandela, Nelson. 1956. "Freedom in our Lifetime." *Liberation*.

Mandela, Nelson. 1995. *Long Walk To Freedom: The Autobiography of Nelson Mandela*. Boston, MA: Black Bay Books/Little, Brown and Company.

Marais, Hein. 2008. *South Africa: Limits to Change: The Political Economy of Transition*. New York: Zed Books.

Mars, Perry. 1998. *Ideology and Change: The Transformation of the Caribbean Left*. Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press.

Nattrass, Nicoli , and Jeremy Wakeford . 2003. *Macro Economic: Theory and Policy in South Africa*. Second Impression.

South African Communist Party (SACP). 2012. "South African Communist Party Constitution (As Amended at the 13th National Congress, July 2012)." 13th National Congress, July 2012. SACP.

Sartre, Jean-Paul. 1964–1965. "Black Orpheus." Translated by John MacCombie . *Massachusetts Review* 6 (1): 13–52.

Scott, David. 2004. *Conscripts of Modernity: The Tragedy of Colonial Enlightenment*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Terreblache, S. J. 1990. "The Post-Apartheid Economy." *A Journal of Opinion* 18 (2): 14–23.

Terreblanche, S. J. 1999. "The Ideological Journey of South Africa: From the RDP to GEAR Macro-Economic Plan." *Globalization, Poverty, Women and the Church in South Africa*. http://web.uct.ac.za/depts/ricsa/confer/me99/procs/pro_terr.htm.

"The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP): A Policy Framework." n.d.

Wehner, Joachim. 2000. "Development Strategies in Post-Apartheid South Africa." *African Spectrum* 35 (2): 183–192.

"White Paper on Reconstruction and Development." 1994. Parliament of the Republic of South Africa, Cape Town.

The Aftermath of Tragedy

- Bernal, Richard. 2015. *The Influence of Small States on Superpowers: Jamaica and U.S. Foreign Policy*. New York: Lexington Books.
- Bond, Patrick. 2004. *Talk Left Walk Right: South Africa's Frustrated Global Reforms*. Scottsville: University of Kwazulu-Natal Press.
- Chirwa, Danwood Mzikenge. 2004. "Water Privatization and Socio-Economic Rights in South Africa." *Law Democracy & Development* 8: 181–206.
- Fukuyama, Francis. 1992. *The End of History and the Last Man*. New York: Free Press.
- Gibson, William E. , and Don Melvin . 1989. "Jamaica's Future Michael Manley Returns to Power on a Crest of Popularity." *Sun Sentinel*, February 12.
- Gordon, Jane A. , and Lewis R. Gordon . 2009. *Of Divine Warning: Reading Disaster in the Modern Age*. Boulder, CO and London: Paradigm Publishers.
- Gunst, Laurie. n.d. *Bron Fi' Dead: A Journey Through the Jamaican Posse Underworld*. New York: Henry Holt and Company.
- Hossie, Linda. 1990. "Jamaica Press by Stringent Economy." *The Globe and Mail*, February 19.
- James, Canute. 1986. "Jamaica Replies." *Journal of Commerce*, December 28.
- James, Canute. 1987. "Jamaica Puts Hotels on the Block as Part of Its Divestment Plan." *Journal of Commerce*, April 30: 5A.
- Journal of Commerce*. 1987. "Jamaican Cement Plant Eyes US Market." June 19: 4A.
- Journal of Commerce*. n.d. "Privatization Has Mixed Results in Latin America and the Caribbean." 3A.
- Kesselring, Rita. 2017. *Bodies of Truth: Law Memory and Emancipation in Post-Apartheid South Africa*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Marais, Hein. 2008. *South Africa: Limits to Change: The Political Economy of Transition*. New York: Zed Books.
- Meeks, Brian. 2000. "The Political Moment in Jamaica: The Dimensions of Hegemonic Dissolution." In *Dispatches from the Ebony Tower: Intellectuals Confront the African American Experience*, edited by Manning Marable . New York: Colombia University Press.
- Modest, Wayne. n.d. "Slavery and the (Symbolic) Politics of Memory in Jamaica." In *Representing Enslavement in Museums: Ambiguous Engagements*, edited by L. Smith , G. Cubitt , R. Wilson , and K. Fouseki . New York: Routledge.
- Seaga, Edward. 2010. *My Life and Leadership: Hard Road to Travel 1980–2008*. Vol. 2. London: Macmillan Education.
- Sikhakhane, Jabulani. 2017. "IMF May Yet Be SA's Last Resort." *Sunday Times*, January 17.
- Terreblanche, Christine. 2003. "We Will Fight On, Vow Apartheid Victims." *IOL*, April 16.
- The Economist*. 1997. "Michael Manley." March 13.
- Whitehouse, David. 2001. "General Strike Targets Privatization Plan." *Socialist Worker*, September 14: 7.