INTRODUCTION

Feeling exclusion, generating exclusion

Giovanni Tarantino and Charles Zika

On 13 April 1986, Pope John Paul II made an official visit to the Great Synagogue of Rome, in what was the first ever visit by a pope to a place of Jewish worship. In his address to the Jewish community of Rome, the Pope alluded to the improvement of relations between Jews and Christians brought about by the *Declaration on the Relation of the Church with Non-Christian Religions*, 'Nostra Aetate', issued by the Second Vatican Council in October 1965. He then said something that is of particular relevance for the subject of this collection:

The Jewish religion is not 'extrinsic' to us, but in a certain way is 'intrinsic' to our own religion. With Judaism therefore we have a relationship which we do not have with any other religion. You are our dearly beloved brothers and, in a certain way, it could be said that you are our elder brothers.¹

Amidst the widespread euphoria over John Paul II's visit, it was left to the historian Carlo Ginzburg to point out that the term 'elder brothers' is not just a bland expression of friendship, but refers to Romans 9:12: 'The elder shall serve the younger. Just as it is written: "Jacob I loved, but Esau I hated."' By a sort of unintentional theological lapse, just as he was striving to blunt the edges of existing divisions between the two religious communities, John Paul II once again became entangled in the traditional theology of typological thinking: the elder brother Esau, standing for Judaism, has been superseded and replaced in the history of salvation by his younger brother Jacob, who represents the Christian Church.²

This intriguing insight, by a historian who has done ground-breaking work on the victims of persecution by ecclesiastical inquisitions, illustrates very graphically the way in which the internalized views of religious alterity, or alterity in

general, create some of the most difficult obstacles to be overcome in the process of building a more inclusive society—that is, a society that does not wave the flag of identity as a weapon to separate insiders from outsiders, a society capable of engaging with and accepting diversity, with humility, curiosity, and respect, rather than with diffidence, fear, mockery, or disdain.

Feeling Exclusion aims to open up the emotional strategies that contributed to the formation and maintenance of stereotypes of difference throughout much of Europe between the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries. It does not focus primarily on the proclamation of such views by society's designated leaders in formal treatises or decrees—whether concerning the adherents of other rival Christian churches, the members of non-Christian faiths such as Turks or Jews, or those like witches and the “natives” on Europe's margins and beyond, whose ritual practices often categorized them as devotees of a diabolical form of pseudo-religion. It intends rather to explore the myriad ways that stereotypical claims of difference permeated daily life and culture, in the shadow of immense political and religious upheaval, the flight of unprecedented numbers into physical or internal exile, and the trauma, disenchantment, dissimulation, and secrecy that such events inevitably brought in their wake.

To help achieve this aim, this collection has turned to some of the methods and insights derived from the recent focus on emotions in historical studies, and used them to understand better the social impact Reformation conflicts had on post-Reformation societies. Emotions methodologies allow us to peer more deeply into the many different ways historical processes seep into the everyday lives of individuals and communities. Emotions provide us with a window on experience; they give us insight into how individuals and communities caught up in historical conflicts deploy their emotional attachments to create their own particular histories and an understanding of the world in which they live.³ This collection aims, therefore, to uncover the different ways the conflicts resulting from the religious changes brought by the Reformation are experienced, viscerally and psychologically; how these experiences are made conscious and also visible, through the articulation of emotion; how emotions in turn drive individuals to adopt frameworks for understanding, dealing with and mastering their sense of displacement and alienation; how some adopt emotional strategies to cope with such trauma or to create rationales for resistance; and how emotions are deployed by individuals, institutions, and communities to reproduce their structures of authority through intolerance and exclusion.

By focusing on the emotions that drove acts of exclusion or expulsion, as well as the feelings that resulted for those who were sent into physical or internal exile, this book's approach attempts to integrate critical human dimensions into well-established stories. In the quest to uncover emotions, the authors consider not only first-person accounts, as in diaries and letters, but also sermons and literary parodies, the authority of the court room and biblical quotation, objects such as sacred relics or treasured letters, prints and other visual media,

communal ritual and bodily gesture, and memorials that both enshrine and release emotion.

Language, gesture, object—all can become powerful media in which strong emotions are invested with the purpose of projecting and disseminating emotionally charged views of the religious “other” or of the misery and trauma of marginalized, persecuted, displaced or exiled individuals and communities. Sara Ahmed has shown us how emotions “stick” to objects, which then embed and carry these emotions, thereby accruing the power to arouse human agents, or to draw them together into new forms of association.⁴ However, the social context of time and place, the particular emotional arena in which different actions take place, contemporary understanding and expectations related to gender, and more generally the feeling rules current within a particular community—all impact on the reception and understanding of these emotions as well as on the sequence of emotions they can subsequently arouse within observers or readers.⁵

Culturally specific ways to control, express, mobilize, or repress emotions are touched on across the chapters, and discernible changes in emotional reactions to comparable phenomena are highlighted in this collection. One example is the fascinating case of changing attitudes toward witchcraft in the twilight of early modern Spain (Chap. 13). This brought to mind Barbara Rosenwein’s penetrating critique of Norbert Elias’s narrative that described the history of the West as the history of increasing emotional restraint. We concur with Rosenwein’s view that this grand narrative is no longer viable. The new narrative, Rosenwein writes, ‘recognizes various emotional styles, emotional communities, emotional outlets, and emotional restraints in *every* period, and it considers how and why these have changed over time’.⁶

The geographical scope of the collection is broad, albeit European. It ranges across France, England, the Netherlands, Italy, the Swiss confederation, Spain, and several German-speaking territories. It investigates a shared history that stretches from the campaigns against “Waldensian” witches and other heretics in France from the mid-fifteenth century and the expulsion of Jews from Spain at the end of the fifteenth century to the persecution of different groups during the long period of religious reformations over the following centuries, that sparked waves of expulsion, migration, imprisonment, and execution. While the focus on emotions in the exclusion policies of governments and the lives of excluded religious communities has not as yet been the subject of scholarly study, the individual chapters do build on a number of recent important works.⁷

The chapters in Part 1, *Belonging and Displacement*, investigate the complex relationships between communities in exile, the homelands from which they fled or were exiled, and other communities of fellow believers from whom they could seek physical or psychological assistance in their marginalized condition. Emotions are considered first among the strategic devices of excluded individuals and communities seeking support and assistance from co-religionists across Europe, and from family and friends who had emigrated to supposedly more tolerant countries. Penny Roberts analyses the deep resentment and disillusionment

found in the memoirs of exiles to Switzerland and England in the second half of the sixteenth century, who had been forced to leave country, home, family, and friends. Susan Broomhall explores the hopeful supplications sent from persecuted Huguenots in the southern Low Countries and northern France to family and friends who had safely migrated across the Channel at the end of the 1660s. David van der Linden examines the emotionally charged dialogue between exiled ministers and their flock between London, Amsterdam, Berlin, and Geneva after the revocation of the Edict of Nantes, while Ole Peter Grell documents the mixed emotions of hope and despair that informed the desperate requests for help sent by refugees in German-speaking territories during the Thirty Years War to Calvinist congregations throughout Europe. These chapters clearly demonstrate how the Huguenot diaspora provides a particularly strong case study through which to explore feelings of loss and belonging, as well as the deployment of collective identities created through the experience of persecution, displacement, and dispossession brought about through religious conflict.

The contributions to Part 2, *Coping with Persecution and Exile*, consider the coping strategies religious refugees developed in order to deal with their marginalization and exclusion, whether physical or internal exile. Critical to these strategies were the ways in which such feelings were internalized, transforming their stereotyping as others into a positive condition that could generate strong feelings of comfort, confidence, resilience, and hope. Their refugee experience and identity would ultimately become ‘a form of social capital’, as Nicholas Terpstra argues in the afterword to this collection. This is similar to the phenomenon of African Americans applying the word “race” to themselves, in order to express their collective identity and turn the word’s original derogatory use on its head.⁸ Claire Walker shows how the mobility of relics across the English Channel connected fragmented communities of English Catholic nuns during the seventeenth century, and how their connections to Christ’s torments and martyrs allowed them to fashion common narratives of anguish and alienation. This widespread strategy, of taking on the language of Christian sacrifice and martyrdom to make sense of suffering, is also explored by Giovanni Tarantino, through the letters from prison of the Piedmontese Waldensian, Sebastian Bazan, as he prepared for his execution, and by Dolly MacKinnon, in the retelling of narratives in the face of persecution suffered by the Scottish Covenanters in the late seventeenth century. The promise of martyrdom provided a belief in ultimate victory against persecutors. Martyrdom was an emotional burden, but also a privilege and a viaticum for inner transformation, argues Gary Waite in his consideration of the Dutch Anabaptist prophet, David Joris, who found in spiritualism the divine love that displaced the fear and anger he felt at his ongoing persecution. In the case of the Quakers, John Marshall shows how their suffering as Christians under persecution led them to conceive and entertain forms of religious toleration and to openly condemn the slave trade.

Part 3, “Othering” Strategies, focuses on the strategies deployed to generate feelings of exclusion in others through models of social difference or alterity that question loyalty, shared values, trust, and control, and how such models and the feelings of exclusion they generate are maintained through a variety of media and representation. Such strategies are common in the confessional conflicts created by movements for religious reform in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Paola von Wyss-Giacosa demonstrates in her elegant study of a series of Bernard Picart engravings just how subtle and nuanced these strategies could be, employing sequence, size, style, and placement within a pictorial programme—what Wyss-Giacosa calls ‘con-visualisation’—to elicit feelings of sympathy or rejection among viewers. Similar strategies, if often more crude and confronting, were deployed in interactions between Christians and Jews. In his analysis of the *Toledot Yeshu*, a parody of the life of Jesus, Daniel Barbu clearly demonstrates, however, how the arousal by Jews of negative feelings among Christians in response to such crude parody frequently also represents a way of feeling and maintaining Jewish identity in a hostile Christian world. Charles Zika, on the other hand, focuses on the exclusionary policies directed against the fictive figure of the witch. He argues that the increasing prominence given to witches’ dances from the later sixteenth century helped identify witches as members of a wholly alien society, governed by insatiable lust and frenzied zeal to destroy Christian communities—which consequently justified their merciless prosecution. Yet by the later eighteenth century, as Maria Tausiet shows, that world had been turned upside down. In her exploration of a case of possession in a northern Spanish village, those making accusations of witchcraft were now the ones subjected to parody and ridicule by Church leaders and accused of being driven by uncontrolled anger and a superstitious world view that no longer prevailed in an enlightened age.

In his *Afterword*, Nicholas Terpstra draws notice to another important aspect of the various campaigns in early modern Europe directed towards exclusion—whether as a form of segregation, overt persecution, or expulsion—which is sometimes difficult to comprehend and demands closer attention by historians: the ‘wilful forgetting’ by the victims of one campaign, who themselves turn into victimisers in another. On the other hand, if a “charitable hatred” too often actualized the Augustinian reading of Luke 14:23 (that one should *compel* people to come to the banquet) as a justification for forced conversion to Christianity, pious frauds were not infrequently called for by Christian deists, irenicists, and Latitudinarians. But, as Terpstra aptly argues with reference to Spiritualists and Quakers, ‘the consequences of love were simply too fearful’. Some were simply beyond toleration, and those of true faith had to be protected from the contagion they might introduce. The Huguenot sceptic, Pierre Bayle, who was himself a refugee in addition to being an influential theorist of toleration, was deeply suspicious of those who even thought of being able to define “true religion”. He believed that any effort to put up fences, however innocuous they

might seem, reflected an underlying attachment to an ideology that would ultimately lead to the erecting of further fences.⁹

Fences, or indeed walls, both physical and cultural, have become one of the defining features of early twenty-first century political discourse and experience—only a little more than twenty years after one of the defining walls of the twentieth century, the Berlin Wall, was brought down. Alternative legal walls can also be created—such as by excising a whole national territory from the right of refugees to apply for a visa there, as the Australian government did in 2013, which then enabled them to send such refugees to detention centres on Pacific Islands between one and four thousand kilometres to the north. *Feeling Exclusion* provides a critical historical context for us to understand the current global migration and refugee crises as well as the intensity of emotional responses on the part of those displaced and the communities they orbit and join.

We have certainly learnt many of the lessons of those times: the need for co-existence, social inclusion, and religious toleration. And we know how deeply enriched and enlivened host communities can become from an influx of refugees of conscience, as American historian of the Roman Inquisition John Tedeschi once remarked, with reference to sixteenth-century Italian religious refugees. He went on to note:

The small but elite band of scholars and scientists, who were compelled to find new homes in northern and central Europe, were no less a channel for the diffusion of learning than their twentieth-century counterparts, the Barons, Gilberts, Kristellers, Kuttners, Lowinskys, Panofskys and many others who revitalised American studies in their fields.¹⁰

However, it is clear every day that we have not yet abandoned many of the attitudes we find in the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries, the fear of those with world views different to our own, the mistrust of the displaced and refugees, the lack of sufficient compassion to feel the stress and pain of those experiencing exclusion. Edward Said aptly noted in his reflections on exile:

Exile is strangely compelling to think about but terrible to experience. It is the unhealable rift forced between a human being and a native place, between the self and its true home: its essential sadness can never be surmounted.¹¹

No doubt reflecting on his own experience, Said considered later moments of heroism and triumph as little more than attempts to overcome deeply felt sorrow and estrangement. The pain of exile was not only deep, but it lived on through some kind of continuing emotional scarring: 'The achievements of exile are permanently undermined by the loss of something left behind for ever.'

Notes

- 1 "From Pope John Paul II's discourse during his visit to the Rome Synagogue on 13 April 1986," *Tertium Millennium* 5 (November, 1997): n.p. http://www.vatican.va/jubilee_2000/magazine/documents/ju_mag_01111997_p-42x_en.html.
- 2 Carlo Ginzburg, "Pope Wojtyla's Slip," in *Wooden Eyes: Nine Reflections on Distance* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), 173–80.
- 3 See the recent review essay: Johannes Lang, "New Histories of Emotion," *History and Theory* 57 (2018): 104–20. As well as many of the chapters in this collection, see Erika Kuijpers, "Fear, Indignation, Grief and Relief: Emotional Narratives in War Chronicles from the Netherlands (1568–1648)" and Sigrun Haude, "Experiencing the Thirty Years War: Autobiographical Writings by Members of Religious Orders in Bavaria," in *Disaster, Death and the Emotions in the Shadow of the Apocalypse, 1400–1700*, ed. Jennifer Spinks and Charles Zika (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 93–111, 135–53.
- 4 Sara Ahmed, *The Cultural Politics of Emotion* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004).
- 5 For emotional practices, arenas, and communities, see especially Monique Scheer, "Are Emotions a Kind of Practice (and Is That What Makes Them Have a History)? A Bourdieuan Approach to Understanding Emotion," *History and Theory* 51 (2012): 193–220; Mark Seymour, "Emotional Arenas: From Provincial Circus to National Courtroom in Late Nineteenth-Century Italy," *Rethinking History* 16 (2012): 177–97; Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006).
- 6 Barbara H. Rosenwein, "Worrying about Emotions in History," *American Historical Review* 107 (2002): 845.
- 7 Some examples are Alexandra Walsham, *Charitable Hatred: Tolerance and Intolerance in England, 1500–1700* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2006); Lyndal Roper, *The Witch in the Western Imagination* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2012); Geert H. Janssen, *The Dutch Revolt and Catholic Exile in Reformation Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014); Jesse Sponholz and Gary Waite, eds, *Exile and Religious Identity, 1500–1800* (London: Pickering and Chatto, 2014); David van der Linden, *Experiencing Exile: Huguenot Refugees in the Dutch Republic, 1680–1700* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015); Nicholas Terpstra, *Religious Refugees in the Early Modern World* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015); Peter Burke, *Exiles and Expatriates in the History of Knowledge, 1500–2000* (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2017).
- 8 See Giovanni Tarantino, "Feeling White in the Pre-Modern Western World: Beneath and Beyond," in *The Routledge History of Emotions in Europe, 1100–1700*, ed. Susan Broomhall and Andrew Lynch (London, New York: Routledge, 2020), 303–19.
- 9 Pierre Bayle, *De la tolérance. Commentaire philosophique sur ces paroles de Jésus-Christ 'Contrains-les-d'entrer'*, ed. Jean-Michel Gros (Paris: Presses Pocket, 1992), 271–72.
- 10 John Tedeschi, *Intellettuai in esilio. Dall'Inquisizione romana al fascismo*, ed. Giorgio Caravale and Stefania Pastore (Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 2012), 349.
- 11 Edward Said, *Reflections on Exile and Other Literary and Cultural Essays* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2000), 173.

Bibliography

- Ahmed, Sara. *The Cultural Politics of Emotion*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004.
- Bayle, Pierre. *De la tolérance. Commentaire philosophique sur ces paroles de Jésus-Christ 'Contrains-les-d'entrer'*. Edited by Jean-Michel Gros. Paris: Presses Pocket, 1992.

- Burke, Peter. *Exiles and Expatriates in the History of Knowledge, 1500–2000*. Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2017.
- “From Pope John Paul II’s Discourse during His Visit to the Rome Synagogue on 13 April 1986.” *Tertium Millennium* 5 (November, 1997): n.p. www.vatican.va/jubilee_2000/magazine/documents/ju_mag_01111997_p-42x_en.html.
- Ginzburg, Carlo. *Wooden Eyes: Nine Reflections on Distance*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2001.
- Janssen, Geert H. *The Dutch Revolt and Catholic Exile in Reformation Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Lang, Johannes. “New Histories of Emotion.” *History and Theory* 57 (2018): 104–20.
- Roper, Lyndal. *The Witch in the Western Imagination*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2012.
- Rosenwein, Barbara H. “Worrying about Emotions in History.” *American Historical Review* 107 (2002): 821–45.
- Rosenwein, Barbara H. *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006.
- Said, Edward. *Reflections on Exile and Other Literary and Cultural Essays*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2000.
- Scheer, Monique. “Are Emotions a Kind of Practice (And Is That What Makes Them Have a History)? A Bourdieuan Approach to Understanding Emotion.” *History and Theory* 51 (2012): 193–220.
- Seymour, Mark. “Emotional Arenas: From Provincial Circus to National Courtroom in Late Nineteenth-Century Italy.” *Rethinking History* 16 (2012): 177–97.
- Spinks, Jennifer, and Charles Zika, eds. *Disaster, Death and the Emotions in the Shadow of the Apocalypse, 1400–1700*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016.
- Sponholz, Jesse, and Gary K. Waite, eds. *Exile and Religious Identities, 1500–1800*. London: Pickering & Chatto, 2014.
- Tarantino, Giovanni. “Feeling White in the Pre-Modern Western World: Beneath and Beyond.” In *The Routledge History of Emotions in Europe, 1100–1700*, edited by Susan Broomhall and Andrew Lynch, 303–19. London; New York: Routledge, 2020.
- Tedeschi, John. *Intellettuali in esilio. Dall’Inquisizione romana al fascismo*. Edited by Giorgio Caravale and Stefania Pastore. Rome: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 2012.
- Terpstra, Nicholas. *Religious Refugees in the Early Modern World: An Alternative History of the Reformation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Van der Linden, David. *Experiencing Exile: Huguenot Refugees in the Dutch Republic, 1680–1700*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2015.
- Walsham, Alexandra. *Charitable Hatred: Tolerance and Intolerance in England, 1500–1700*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2006.